

Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation

ANDREW M. CUOMO Governor ERIK KULLESEID Commissioner

September 19, 2019

Mr. Joe Bonura Kingstonian Development LLC 2975 Rt 9W New Windsor, NY 12553

Re: ESDC Kingstonian Development Fair Street at North Front Street, Kingston, NY 19PR00786

Dear Mr. Bonura:

Thank you for continuing to consult with the New York State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO). We have reviewed the submitted materials in accordance with the New York State Historic Preservation Act of 1980 (section 14.09 of the New York Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation Law). These comments are those of the Division for Historic Preservation and relate only to Historic/Cultural resources.

We have reviewed your recent submission which includes visual simulations and other materials related to the proposed development. Based on this review, we have the following comments and concerns regarding the project as currently presented:

- The proposed new infill garage building design is generally appropriate. This location historically contained the large Montgomery Ward store and warehouse building. We recommend that visibility of the elevator tower/ penthouse on the garage building be minimized to the greatest extent possible, particularly as viewed from Wall Street.
- The Herzog's warehouse building is a non-contributing structure within the National Register district. The proposed new construction appears to be an approximate reconstruction of the historic hotel structure. While the proposed design is generally appropriate, we recommend that the color scheme be more compatible with the surrounding district. We recommend continued consultation with the local historic preservation commission regarding the design and color of this building.
- North Front Street is the traditional district boundary marked by a distinct natural drop-off down toward the Esopus Creek. This natural contour clearly marks the northern boundary of the historic 1658 stockade. The lower portion to the north of the district now contains modern buildings and the shopping plaza further to the north, but the historic boundary remains readily apparent and continues to characterize the district. The new construction would significantly alter the northern district boundary and would be clearly visible from within the historic district. The Montgomery Ward building, now demolished, was the only structure that extended significantly beyond that traditional northern border. The proposed new development is much larger and would extend well beyond the old Montgomery Ward footprint.
- By the mid-19th century, when the commercial street front was developed, the section of Fair Street extending north from North Front Street was established to access railroad facilities

and the lumber yards. This historic street, which allows pedestrian and vehicular access to the district, would be virtually eliminated as part of the proposed development.

• The historic commercial and residential buildings of the Kingston Stockade are characterized by a variety of materials, styles, and colors. The new construction is monolithic compared with the surrounding district. Though the currently proposed design attempts to reference the historic setting and surrounding architecture, we believe that a much greater effort is warranted for a construction of this scale.

In accordance with the Secretary of the Interior Standards, and based on our comments above, we believe that the proposed development will have adverse effects to the Kingston Stockade Historic District. Through our continued consultation, we request that you develop and evaluate modifications to this project that could avoid, minimize, or mitigate the adverse effects.

If you have any questions, I can be reached at (518) 268-2164.

Sincerely,

10-

Weston Davey Historic Site Restoration Coordinator weston.davey@parks.ny.gov

via e-mail only

CC. Meghan Ferrelli, ESDC Kyla DeDea, Kingston Planning Suzanne Cahil, Kingston Planning